BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
31761 10084433 1

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW

PROFESSOR JACOB S. ZIEGEL

with the assistance of Jonathan Yen

FALL 1988

The materials reproduced in this casebook are for the use of the students at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, and are not for commercial sale.

KF
1536
ZA2
Z54
1988

LAW LIBRARY
SEP 27 1988
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW

PROFESSOR JACOB S. ZIEGEL

with the assistance of Jonathan Yen

FALL 1988

The materials reproduced in this casebook
are for the use of the students at the
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto,
and are not for commercial sale.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casebookoncanadi00zieg

PREFACE

The materials in this volume, collated under considerable pressure, are designed for an introductory one-semester, two-hours-a-week seminar on Canadian bankruptcy and receivership law.

I owe two particular debts. One is to Jonathan Yen (U. of T., LL.B. 1987) for shouldering much of the burden of compiling the materials; the other is to the editors of Gertner, Springman, McGuinness, Morrison, Stewart and Laskin, Debtor and Creditor, 3rd ed. (1987), and especially to Jody Morrison and George Stewart for facilitating my task of selecting suitable bankruptcy cases.

J.S.Z.

10.8.88

Professor J. S. Ziegel
Fall 1988

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW, FALL 1988

SYLLABUS AND TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page No.

Preface i

Selected Bibliography xiii

Week 1. Sept. 13th THE OBJECTIVES OF BANKRUPTCY LAW, CANADIAN HISTORY, AND CURRENT PROCEDURES FOR MAKING A PERSON BANKRUPT

A. Objectives & History of Bankruptcy Law

Extracts, Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy Law..... 1

Extracts, Tassé Report, "The History of Bankruptcy"..... 12

Id., "The Present Canadian Legislation"..... 18

Id., "The Canadian Legislation Since Confederation"..... 23

"Bankruptcy Statistics"..... 29

B. Commencement of Bankruptcy Proceedings:

1. Involuntary Bankruptcy:

B.A. ss. 24-28, 2 (definition of "locality of debtor"), 8(1), 157(9) to (11)

Re Holmes and Sinclair 33

Re Cedarhurst Properties Ltd. 36

Page No.

In re E. De La Hooke (Ont. S.C.) 40

2. Voluntary Bankruptcy

B.A. ss. 31, 24(2), 151, 126, and 2 (definition of "insolvent person", "locality of a debtor", "person" and "corporation").

Week 2 Sept. 20th COLLECTION OF BANKRUPTCY ESTATE & PROPERTY EXCLUDED THEREFROM

B.A. ss. 47-48, 50-53

1. "Property" vesting in trustee - exceptions thereto

Re Ritenburg; Ritenburg v. Crown Trust Company 45

Deloitte, Haskins & Sells Limited v. Graham 49

2. Exempt Property

Re Neuls and Neuls; Touche Ross Limited v. First City Trust Company 53

Extract, Tassé Report, "Exemptions" 62

Extract, Bill C-17, 1984, s. 158..... 63

3. Property subject to a trust: s. 47

B.A. s. 47

James F. Lawrie & Company Limited v. Moffat 64

Royal Bank of Canada v. 216200 Alberta Ltd. 68

Page No.

Week 3 Sept. 27th TREATMENT OF SECURED CREDITORS

1. Property subject to a security interest

B.A. ss. 50(5), 2 (definition of "secured creditor")

Re Bright 72

Re Szeles 79

Extract, Ziegel, Geva & Cuming, Commercial & Consumer Transactions, 2nd ed. 83

Ontario Personal Property Security Act, ss. 1-2; 9-15

Extract, Varley, "Receivership: The Contest Between Secured and General Creditors"..... 90

Goode, "Is the Law Too Favourable to Secured Creditors?" 94

2. Treatment of Secured Creditors under the Act

B.A. ss. 98, 99, 103, 104.

Extract, Houlden & Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada..... 107

Re Ryan 109

Week 4 Sept. 27th STATUTORY TRUSTS AND PREFERENTIAL GOVERNMENT LIEN CLAIMS

Deputy Minister of Revenue v. Paul Rainville 112

Re Phoenix Paper Products Limited 116

Deloitte Haskins and Sells Limited v. W.C.B. 127

Extract, Bill C-17, 1984, ss. 265(1), 265(4)(i), 270 134

Extract, Advisory Committee Report, "Crown Priority" 135

Page No.

Bogart, "Statutory Claims and PPS Legislation: A Proposal".... 139

Plumb, "The New Federal Tax Lien Law" 151

U.S. Internal Revenue Code, ss. 6321-6323 155

Week 5 Oct. 4th AVOIDANCE AND REVIEW OF ANTECEDENT TRANSACTIONS

B.A. ss. 20, 48(1)

(a) Avoidance of Security Interests

OPPSA, s. 22

Re Bellini Manufacturing and Importing Ltd. 163

International Harvester v. Touche Ross 166

Notes 174

(b) Settlements

B.A. ss. 69, 70, 71

Re Whetstone 176

(c) Reviewabl Transactions

B.A. ss. 78 & 79.

Extract, B.C.L.R.C. Report 184

Clarkson v. White 193

Extract, Bill C-17, 1984, ss. 169 - 175 196

Page No.

(d) Preferences

B.A. s. 73

Hudson v. Benallack 198

Re Van Der Liek 202

Fraudulent Conveyances Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 176 204

Extract, B.C.L.R.C. Report 206

(e) Protected Transactions

B.A. s. 75

(f) Interaction of Federal and Provincial Legislation

Robinson v. Countrywide Factors Ltd. 212

Petomaa, "Constitutional Validity of Provincial Legislation" .. 220

Week 6 Oct. 18th DISTRIBUTION OF BANKRUPT'S ESTATE

B.A. ss. 107 (1)

(a) Landlord's Claim

In re Gingras 225

(b) Wage Earners' Priorities

Extracts, Advisory Committee Report, "Wage Earners Protection"..... 229

Page No.

Brown, "Final Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Wage Protection in Insolvency Situations" 243

Gleig, "Unpaid Wages in Bankruptcy" 251

See also materials, supra, Week 4

(c) Directors' Liabilities for Unpaid Wages and other Benefits

OBCA s. 131 262

CBCA s. 114 263

(d) Recommendations for Reform

Extract, Tassé Report 264

Week 7 Oct. 25th CONSEQUENCES OF BANKRUPTCY AND DISCHARGES FROM BANKRUPTCY

(a) Consequences of Bankruptcy

Vachon v. Canada Employment and Immigration Commission 268

Amanda Designs Boutique Limited v. Charisma Fashion 276

(b) Discharge from Bankruptcy

B.A. ss. 139 - 152

Kozack v. Richter 283

Consumers' Gas Co. v. Stewart 287

Ferron, "The Approach of the Courts to the Discharge of Bankrupt Judgment Debtors" 290

Page No.

Extract, Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy Law..... 301

Week 8 Nov. 1st ALTERNATIVES TO BANKRUPTCY: COMMERCIAL REORGANIZATIONS

B.A. Part III

Fisher Oil & Gas v. Guaranty Bank & Trust Company 316

Extract, Houlden & Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada 320

Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-25 322

Leonard, "Recent Developments and Trends in Financial Reorganizations"..... 326

Extract, Advisory Committee Report, "Stay of Proceedings by Secured Creditors"..... 341

Quinn, "Corporate Reorganization and Strategic Behaviour..".. 347

Bill C-17, 1984, Part IV - See CCH Canada Bankruptcy Legislation.

Week 9 Nov. 9th CONSUMER ARRANGEMENTS AND CONSUMER BANKRUPTCIES

B.A. Part X

Orderly Payment of Debts Statistics 376

Ziegel, "Consumer Bankruptcies" 377

Extract, Brighton & Connidis, "Consumer Bankrupts in Canada".. 382

Bill C-17, 1984, Part III 397

Page No.

Week 10 Nov. 15th RECEIVERSHIPS AND FIXED AND FLOATING CHARGES

A. FLOATING CHARGES

I. The Floating Charge at Common Law and under the PPSA

1. Common Law Position

Pennington, "The Genesis of the Floating Charge" 405

R. in Right of B.C. v. F.B.D.B. 409

2. Crystallization of Floating Charge

The Queen in Right of British Columbia v. Consolidated Churchill Copper Corp. Ltd. 420

Mackay and Hughes (1973) Ltd. v. Martin Potatoes Inc.... 432

3. Demand for Payment: How much time is the debtor entitled to?

Ronald Elwyn Lister Ltd. v. Dunlop Canada Ltd. 437

Bank of Baroda v. Panessar 441

II. The Floating Charge under the Ont. PPSA

OPPSA ss. 9, 12, 21, 22, 27, 34, 55; Bill 51, 1988

Re Huxley Catering Limited v. CIBC 446

Royal Bank of Canada v. G.M. Homes Inc. 449

Notes 450

Cantamar Holdings Ltd. v. Tru-View Aluminum Products 451

Page No.

Ziegel, "Recent and Prospective Developments in the PPS Area" 453

Week 11 Nov. 22nd RECEIVERSHIPS AND FIXED AND FLOATING CHARGES

B. RECEIVERSHIPS

1. Definition and History

Extract, Picarda, The Law Relating to Receivers and Managers 457

2. Court Appointed and Privately Appointed Receivers: Practical and Legal Considerations

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships 460

Royal Bank of Canada v. White Cross Properties Ltd. 462

Federal Trust Company v. Frisina 465

3. Differences Between Receiver and Manager

In re Manchester and Milford Railway Co. 469

4. Duties and Powers of Receivers

CBCA ss. 94 - 95 (Part VIII)..... 474

Parsons v. The Sovereign Bank of Canada..... 475

Re TIW Industries Ltd. and Clarkson Co. Ltd. 478

CIBC v. Whitman 481

Page No.

5. Status of Receivers as Agent of Company

Peat Marwick Ltd. v. Consumers' Gas Co. 486

Sperry Inc. v. C.I.B.C. 493

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships 498

Week 12 Nov. 29th RECEIVERSHIPS AND FIXED AND FLOATING CHARGES

6. Rules with respect to realization

J. & W. Investments Ltd. v. Black..... 507

Cuckmere Brick Co. Ltd. v. Mutual Finance Ltd..... 512

O.P.P.S.A. s.59

7. Bankruptcy and Receivership

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships 520

Gosling v. Gaskell 522

Extract, Advisory Committee, "Receivers and Secured Creditors" 526

8. Conflict of Laws Aspects

C.A. Kennedy Co. Ltd. v. Stibbe-Monte Ltd..... 540

Clarkson Co. Ltd. v. Rockwell 549

Page No.

Week 13 Dec. 6th INTERNATIONAL BANKRUPTCY

Robertson, "Enforcement and Other Problems in International Insolvencies"..... 553

Gitlin & Flaschen, "The International Void in the Law of Multinational Bankruptcies" 570

Bill C-17, 1984, ss. 314 - 317 585

US Bankruptcy Code 1978, s. 304 587

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: CANADA

T.G. Anderson, Proprietary and Quasi-proprietary Rights Arising upon Insolvency, University of Toronto (1981).

Bankruptcy: Present Problems and Future Perspectives, Faculty of Law, McGill University (1986).

D.G. Baird & T.H. Jackson, Cases, Problems and Materials on Bankruptcy, (1985).

F. Bennett, Receiverships, Carswell (1985).

J.W. Brighton, Consumer Bankrupts in Canada, Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada (1982).

Business Law: Commercial Insolvency, CBAO (1983).

Canada Bankruptcy Legislation, 2nd ed., CCH (1984).

Duncan and Honsberger, Bankruptcy in Canada, 3rd ed., Canadian Legal Authors Ltd. (1961).

Gertner, Springman et al. Debtor and Creditor: Cases and Commentary, 3rd ed. Carswell (1987).

Houlden and Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada, Carswell (1984).

Impact of Insolvency on Business Relationships, CBAO (1987).

Is Bankruptcy Merely "Back to Business"?, CBAO (1983).

Mega International Insolvencies: Are They "Bailouts", Rescues, or Merely Financial Footwork?", CBAO (1983).

Priorities: Who Gets What After the Fall, CBAO (1984).

Staying Alive: Proposals and Reorganizations, OBCA (1984).

B. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: ENGLAND AND AUSTRALIA

M. Crystal, A Handbook on Bankruptcy and Deeds of Arrangement Law and Practice, London: (1978).

P.G. Earles, A Guide to Bankruptcy, Professional Books (1984).

R.M. Goode, Proprietary Rights and Insolvency in Sales Transactions, Sweet & Maxwell (1985).

W.W. Kerr, Kerr on the Law and Practice as to the Receivers, 16th ed., Sweet & Maxwell (1983).

G. Lightman, The Law of Receivers of Companies, Sweet & Maxwell, (1986).

D. Milman, Corporate Insolvency: Law and Practice, Sweet & Maxwell, (1987).

J. O'Donovan, Company Receivers and Managers, The Law Book Company Limited (1981).

H.A.P. Picarda, The Law Relating to Receivers and Managers, Butterworths (1984).

P.W.D. Redmon, Bankruptcy Law, 7th ed., Macdonald & Evans (1977).

P. Totty, Corporate Insolvency, McGraw-Hill (1982).

C. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: U.S.

Bankruptcy Reform, American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Reform (1978).

J.R. Blinn, Bankruptcy Strategies for Lenders, Professional Education Systems (1987).

P. Blumberg, The Law of Corporate Groups: Problems in the Bankruptcy Reorganization of Parent and Subsidiary Corporations, Little Brown (1985).

W.M. Collier, Collier Bankruptcy Manual, Matthew Bender (1979).

D.R. Cowans, Bankruptcy Law and Practice, West Publishing (1986).

T.H. Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy law, Harvard University Press (1986).

L. Kruger & Quittner, Bankruptcy Practice and Procedure, Practising Law Institute (1985).

M.S. Lurey, Lending Transactions and the Bankruptcy Code,1987, Practicing Law Institute (1987).

A.L. Paskay, Handbook for Trustees and Receivers in Bankruptcy, Bender (1978).

Quittner & L. Krugger, Current Developments in Bankruptcy and Reorganization, 1986, Practicing Law Institute (1986).

D. ARTICLES

W.A. Bogart, "Statutory Claims and Personal Property Security Legislation: A Proposal" (1983) C.B.L.J. 129.

J.M. Ferron "The Approach of the Courts to the Discharge of Bankrupt Judgment Debtors" (1985) 61 C.B.R. (N.S.) 134.

A. Giroux "The Use of the Bankruptcy Act by Secured Creditors" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 232.

R.A. Gitlin "The International Void in the Law of Multinational Bankruptcies" (1987) 42 Bus. Law 307.

D.B. Gleig "Unpaid Wages in Bankruptcy" (1987) 21 U.B.C.L.R. 61.

R.M. Goode "Is the Law Too Favourable to Secured Creditors?" (1983-84) 8 C.B.L.J. 53.

A.K. Kemp-Gee "Insolvency in Practice: A Receiver's View" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1982, 615.

E.B. Leonard "Recent Developments and Trends in Financial Reorganizations" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1985, 161.

W. Meckling "Financial Markets, Default and Bankruptcy: The Role of the State" (1977) 41 Law & Contemporary Problems 13.

R.G. Marantz "Current Trends in Canadian Bankruptcy Law" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1982, 659.

M. Mendelsohn "Canada: A Secured Creditor's Paradise?" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 105.

D. Milman "Receivers as Agents" (1981) 44 M.L.R. 658.

J. O'Donovan "The Duties and Liabilities of a Receiver and Manager Appointed Out of Court" (1979) 12 M.U.L.R. 52.

R. Pennington "The Genesis of the Floating Charge" (1960) 23 M.L.R. 630.

A. Petomaa "Constitutional Validity of Provincial Legislation Subordinating Unperfected Security Interests to Trustees in Bankruptcy" 42 C.B.R. (N.S.) 104.

W. T. Plumb "The New Federal Tax Lien Law" (1966-67) 22 Business Lawyers 271.

J.J. Quinn "Corporate Reorganization and Strategic Behaviour: An Economic Analysis of Canadian Insolvency Law and Recent Proposals for Reform" (1985) 23 O.H.L.J. 1.

R.N. Robertson "Legal Problems on Reorganization of Major Financial and Commercial Debtors" in Mega International Insolvencies: Are They "Bailouts", Rescues, or Merely Financial Footwork?", CBAO (1983).

M. Scott "The Provinces and the Bankruptcy Act: An End Run" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 73.

M.G. Shanker "The Worthier Creditors (and a Cheer for the King)" (1975-76) 1 C.B.L.J. 340.

H.W. Sterling, "Seizures Under Demand Debentures" (1985) 53 C.B.R. (N.S.) 129.

J.R. Varley "Receivership: The Contest Between Secured and General Creditors" in Debtor-Creditor Law: Practice and Doctrine (Springman and Gertner, eds. 1985).

J.R. Varley "Recent Developments and Emerging Trends in the Enforcement of Security - The Receiver Besieged" in Special Lectures of the LSUC 1985, 181.

J.S. Ziegel "Consumer Bankruptcies" (1972) 20 Chitty's L.J. 325.

J.S. Ziegel "Recent and Prospective Developments in the Personal Property Security Area and the Recommendations of the Ontario Advisory Committee" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1985, 1.

E. REPORTS

Brighton & Connidis, Consumer Bankrupts in Canada, Policy Research, Analysis and Liason Directorate, Policy Coordination Bureau, Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada.

D.J.M. Brown Final Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Wage Protection in Insolvency Situations, (1985).

Report of the Advisory Committee on Bankruptcy and Insolvency: Proposed Bankruptcy Act Amendments (**Advisory Committee Report**), Ministry of Supply and Services Canada (1986).

Report of the Study Committee on Bankruptcy and Insolvency Legislation Canada 1970 (**Tassé Report**), Ministry of Supply and Services Canada (1970).

Report of the Review Committee on Insolvency Law and Practice, Cmnd. 8558, (1982).

F. STATUTES: CANADA

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. B-3.

Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-25.

Farm Debt Review Act, S.C. 1986, c. C-33.

Fraudulent Conveyances Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 176.

Winding Up Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. W-10.

An Act Respecting Bankruptcy and Insolvency, Bill-17, 1984.

G. STATUTES: ENGLAND

Insolvency Act, 1986.

H. STATUTES: U.S.

Bankruptcy Reform Act of 1978, Pub. L. No. 95-598, 92 stat. 2549 (1978) (codified at 11 U.S.C. ss. 101 et seq.)

The Bankruptcy Amendments and Federal Judgeship Act of 1984, Pub. l. No. 98-353, 98 Stat. 333 (1984) (enacted July 10, 1984)